



**Canada:  
The State  
of the  
Federation  
2017**

**Canada at 150:  
Federalism and  
Democratic  
Renewal**

Institute of Intergovernmental Relations  
Queen's Policy Studies Series  
School of Policy Studies, Queen's University  
McGill-Queen's University Press  
Montréal & Kingston | London | Ithaca

School of Policy Studies  
Room 412, Robert Sutherland Hall  
138 Union Street

---

# CONTENTS

vii	Acknowledgements
ix	Biographies
1	Introduction

## GENERAL ASSESSMENTS

19	1	Federalism Reform and Democratic Renewal for a Country Based on Incomplete Conquests
33	2	Canadian Federalism, Democracy, and Political Legitimacy

## DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS

59	3	Notwithstanding the Charter: Does Section 33 Accommodate Federalism?
85	4	The Challenge of Modernizing an Upper Chamber of a Federal Parliament in a Constitutional Monarchy: The Senate of Canada in W K H 7 Z H Q W \ ¿ U V W & H Q W X U \

97 5 The Perils and Paranoia of Senate Reform: Does Senate Independence Threaten Canadian Democracy?

111 6 Competing Diversities: Representing “Canada” on the Supreme Court

133 7 Who Participated? Examining Citizen Participation in Electoral Reform

1 R U P D W L Y H - X V W L ç F D W L R Q V I R U ' H P R F U D W L F  
Canadian Electoral Reform

181 9 The Federalist Case for Electoral Reform in Canada

FEDERALISM FOR DIVERSITY: FRENCH AND ENGLISH

3 R O L F \ R Q 4 X p E H F \$ I ç U P D W L R Q D Q G & D Q D G L D

211 11 Federalism “Plus”? Carving a Space of Non-Territorial Autonomy  
L Q D ) H G H U D O 6 W D W H 7 K H & D V H R I 2 I ç F L D O  
Canada

FEDERALISM FOR DIVERSITY: INDIGENOUS

253 13 Nation Tables and the BCTC Tic-Tac-Toe?

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS

271 14 Imagining Canada: Narratives of Federalism in Intergovernmental Organizations

291 15 The Politics of Federal-Local Intergovernmental Relations in Canada



---

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The genesis of this volume is the Institute of Intergovernmental Relations' (IIGR) 2017 State of the Federation conference, which was held June 16 to 17 at Queen's University's Donald Gordon Centre. The conference, entitled

WRRN WKH RSSRUWXQLW\ WR UH

Liberals' democratic reform agenda and—in light of Canada's sesquicentennial year—the legacy and future of Canada's federal and democratic institutions. While contributors used a wide range of criteria to evaluate Canada's democratic and federal architecture, we were struck by their emphasis on the need to accommodate diversity. Many of our contributors believe Canada's democratic and federal institutions have done a reasonably good job of promoting, protecting, and recognizing the identities and interests of the original federal partners. But they also see room to deepen those commitments and extend them to a much broader range of groups, including Indigenous peoples.

2XU ÀUVW DFNQRZOHGJHPHQW JÑ -æZZá5Ê-S™ŸšŽJHP RZO

QXPEHU RI FRQIHUHQFH VSHDNHUV ZKRVH QDPHV GR  
EXW ZKR JUHDWO\ HQULFKHG RXU GLVFXVVLRQ DQG V  
RUGHU WKHVH DWWHQGHV ZHUH -XOLH 6LPQRQV -|U  
9HUUHOOL /HVOLH 6HLGOH 'DULDQ ' :LLZDNDD·LJH  
%HQRLW \$QWRLQH %DFRQ -DQHW ODVQR DQG 3HWH  
DFNQRZOHGJH WKH VXSSRUW RI 'DYLQ (OGHU DQG %R  
RI WKH ,, \*5 DQG EURDGHU IHGHUDOLVP FRPPXQLWLH  
FRQWULEXWLRQV WR WKLV DQG SDVW ,, \*5 HYHQWV Z  
HGLWRU RI WKH ODVW 6WDWH RI WKH )HGHUDWLRQ Y  
KLV LPPHQVH LPSDFW RQ WKH ÀHOG  
,Q SUHSDULQJ WKLV YROXPH IRU SXEOLFDWLRQ DV  
LWVHOI ZH DUH JUDWHIXO IRU WKH GLOLJHQW DQG



---

% , 2 \* 5 \$ 3 + , ( 6

## EDITORS

is an associate professor of political science at Queen's University, and the director of the Queen's Institute of Intergovernmental Relations and the Canadian Opinion Research Archive. Her research focuses on elections and political behaviour, political communication, and the representation of women. She is the author of (UBC Press 2013), which won the 2016 Pierre Savard Award from the International Council of Canadian Studies, and was shortlisted for the 2014 Donald Smiley Prize. She is also a co-editor of (McGill-Queen's University Press 2018).

is an assistant professor of political studies and former associate director of the Institute of Intergovernmental Relations at Queen's University. His research interests include comparative federalism, political economy, public debt DQG & DQDGLDQ SROLWLFV +H LV ZULWLQJ D ERRN F default risk.

\$ 8 7 + 2 5 6

is an assistant professor of Political Science at Royal Military College (Kingston) and Queen's University (cross-appointed). Her research focuses RQ DXWRQRP\ DUUDQJHPHQWV DV ZHOODV RI¿FL



is an associate professor of political science at the University of Waterloo. He is the author of

is an assistant professor at the University of Toronto. He publishes and teaches on the intersection of three areas: federalism, constitutional politics, and the management of diversity. Prior to joining the University of Toronto, he spent a decade with the federal public service working in the areas of intergovernmental relations and social policy.

, is currently adjunct professor at Ryerson University. He taught at the University of Saskatchewan from 1964 until 2004 and is a previous president of the Canadian Political Science Association. His publications include a trilogy of works on each of the parts of parliament. *3 H R S O H ¶ V + R X V* won the Donner Prize for best book in Canadian public policy in 2007.

is a lecturer in the University of Western Ontario's Local Government Program and an associate at the University of Toronto Innovation Policy Lab.

is an associate professor with the School of Political Studies at the University of Ottawa. Her research centres on intergovernmental relations and public policy in a comparative context. New research considers the ways in which different groups within a federation may experience (non)recognition and (dis) *H P S R Z H U P H Q W : K L O H R Q V D E E D W L F D O V K H Z R U N H G* the Intergovernmental Affairs Secretariat. She has published multiple academic and policy papers, has been a contributing co-editor of two books with UBC Press, and has written a book on federalism and education policy in Canada published by the University of Toronto Press.