

The Kenneth MacGregor Lecture

The Supreme Court and the Evolution of Indigenous Rights and Title

!
S b

***The Supreme Court and the
Evolution of Indigenous Rights and Title***

! "#

!

"!

\$%&' ()#*# , &-./%0101#

2(.3#45#6.&' #67.)3# , &13(/3#3%0# , &1)373-37&1#8/39# : ; <=#

#

A I d c I d R a d I d T

!#\$%&' ((%&)*+!\$* , -).!)-#)!(' O!\$' 1!23' \$* , *4#('!5%' 5(% .6!

!

Z!

T -#)!\$% 1 #* 4.! . 7\$5\$* . *4, !* .!) -#)!) -%! Y#) * & #4! -# .! 4% + %\$! \$% 5%# (%8!) -%!] ' &)\$* 4%!
' /!] * . & ' + %\$; !8% . 5*)% !' 4, ' *4, !5\$% . . 7\$% .!' 4! X' 5%! ?\$#4&* .! /\$' 1! F#4#8#6. !C48*, %4' 7.!

C4!#88*)** 4M)-%!5\$' +*. ** 4!)-#)!)ate#)*' 4. !!&%8!(#48!' 4(;!)' !>\$*)#*4!K#48!3;! %E)%4. ** 4M(#)%\$!)' !F#4#8#!#.!)ate%1 3' 8*1 %4!)' /!)ateF\$' O40!(%#8.!)' !)-!Q4#)** 4D)' D &\$' O4R!' \$!Q4#)** 4D)' D4#)** 4R!&-#\$#&)%\$*.)*&' /!)ate(#)%\$!)\$%#)%%. !#48!)' !)-!1 #44%\$!*4! O-*&-!1' .)!' /!)ate!?\$\$.)!)@#)** 4.!)%48!)' !+*%O!)ate*\$!\$%(#)** 4. -*5!O*)ateF#4#8#9!c*+%4!)-*.!\$' (%!#.!)ate!, 7#\$#4)' \$!' /!C48*#4!(#48!)*)(%M#48!)ate!/#&!)ate#)!)ate*.!*!%1 3\$#&%8!*4! .%&)** 4!"a!' /!"#\$ %\$#&' ()** !#+\$&' !#*, -)ate!W' ;#(!X\$' &(#1 #)** 4!*.' ! /)%4!+*%O%8!#.!)ate!QC48*#4!>*((!' /!W*, -).R!#48h' \$!)ate!QC48*#4!` #, 4#!F#\$)#R9!

Pa *The Constitution Act,* a d *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*

i)-%\$!)ate#4! #..*, 4*4, !<7\$.8*&)** 4!' +%\$! C48*#4.!)' !)ate! /%8%\$#(!, ' +%\$4 1 %4)M!)ate! !O#.!(#\$, %(;!.*(%4)!*4!)%\$1 .!' /!5\$' +*. ** 4. !\$%(#)*4, !)' !C48*, %4' 7. ! X%' 5(%9!V' O%+%\$M)ate. !O#. !#4;)ate*4, !37!)ate!&#. %!/' \$!)ate! #48!)ate!#.. ' &*#)%8! 9!?\$' 1!. 9" a!' /!)ate!F-#\$)%\$e!

!

!!

' 4(; !8*8!U%&)*' 4. !"a!#48!Sa!%4. -\$*4%!%E*.)*4, !23' \$*, *4#(!\$, -). !K%9, 9A!)-' .%!/(' O*4, !
/\$' 1!)-%!W' ;#!X\$' &(# 1 #)*' 40!37)!-%; !4' O!#\$%!)' !#55(; !5\$' .5%&)*+%(; !*4!)-%!.%4.%!
)-#!4%O!#48!%4. -\$*4%8!23' \$*, *4#(!\$, -).!#48!)*(%!O*(!/' O!/\$' 1!/7)7\$%!(#48D&(#* 1!

!

d!

?!?' \$' 1!) -%!C48*, %4' 7.!

? ' 748#)*' 4. !O%3. *)%e!&!

C4!M[I dM? \$#4J!F#(8%\$!#48!')-%\$!@* . , #6#!%(8%\$. !. 7%8!) -%!5\$' +*4&*#(!
 , ' +%\$4 1 %4)! ' /!>\$*)* . -!F' (7 1 3*#M8%&(#\$*4, !)-#)!@* . , #6#!)*)(%)' !)-%*\$!
 (#48. !-#8!4%+%\$!3%%4!(#O/7((; !%E)*4, 7*. -%8!)-\$' 7, -!)\$%#); !' \$!3; !#4; !
 ')-%\$! 1 %4. 9!T -*(%!3')-!) -%!>F!U75\$% 1%!F' 7\$)!#48!)-%!F' 7\$)! ' /!
 255%#(!\$%<%&)%8!)-%!&(#* 1 M!)-%!@* . , #6#!#55%#(%8!)' !)-%!U75\$% 1%!F' 7\$)!
 ' /!F#4#8#!/' \$!\$%&' , 4*)* 4! ' /!)-%*\$!23' \$* , *4#(!*)(%)' !)-%*\$!\$#8*)* 4#(M!
 #4&%.)\$#(!#48!74&%8%8!(#48. 9!f!T -#)!) -%!U75\$% 1%!F' 7\$)!&' 4&(78%8!
 O#.!, \$' 7!#4; 44)f!\$' M). 3(.)O. 3(9)-O. 1 (f!)-O. 2(T)-O. 2(\$)O. 1 (&)O. 1 ())-O. 4(!)-O. 2

-#8!3%%4!4%*)-%\$!%E)*4, 7*. -%8!3;!)\$%#);!4' \$!. 75%\$. %8%8!3;!(#O9!: -7. A!
)-%!/8%\$\$(!, '+%\$4 1%4)!3%, #4!)-%!(' 4, !5\$' &%..!' /!4%, ')*#)*4, !
 &' 1 5\$%-4. *+%!. %))(% 1 %4).!' /!23' \$*, *4#(!*)(%A!%+%4)7#((: !&' 4&(78*4, !
 1 ' 8%\$4D8#;!)\$%#)*%.!*4!4' \$)-%\$4!q7j 3%&A!)-!g7J' 4A!)-%!' \$ 1 %\$!

!

ML!

0)\$%#)*%. !#48!.)#)7)%!\$(#)*4,!)' !C48*#4.!.. -' 7(8!3%!(^3%\$#((; !&' 4.)\$7%8!#48!
74&%\$)#*4)*%. !\$. ' (+%8!*4!/#+ ' 7\$!' /!) -%!C48*#4.9!U5%&*/*&#((; !!) -%!&' 7\$)!*4)\$' 87&%8!
4)' !F#4#8#4!<7\$*.5\$78%4&%!#!5\$*4&*5(%!#8' 5)%8!/\$' 1 !#!M[] -D&%4)7\$; !\$7(*4,!*4!) -%!
P4*)%8!U)#)%

!

M''!

SaKM0!' /!: -%!F' 4.)*)7)*' 4!2&)A!M[N''9!23' \$*, *4#(!*)(%!.!#!\$, -)!\$%(#)*4, !
)' !(#48! A!-(8!&' 1 1 74#((; !#48!8*.)*4&!/\$' 1!')-%\$!#4&%.)\$#(!
\$, -).9!23' \$*, *4#(!*)(%!.A!)-%\$%/' \$%A!4!. 73.)#4&%A!#!\$, -)! ' !)%\$\$*)' \$; !

!

MS!

!

MZ!

! O - * & - ! 5 \$ ' + * 8 % . !) - #) ! # (! ^ # 4 8 . ! ! ` * 4 % . ! ! ` * 4 % \$ # (. ! ! # 4 8 !
W ' ; # () * % . ! 3 % (' 4 , * 4 , !) ' !) - % ! . % + % \$ # (! X \$ ' + * 4 & % . ! ' / ! F # 4 # 8 # ! 9 ! 9 ! #) !) - % ! P 4 * ' 4 ! 9 ! 9 ! . - # (!
3 % (' 4 , !) ' !) - % ! . % + % \$ # (! X \$ ' + * 4 & % . 9 R

O#.!%+*8%4&%!)#-#!5#\$.!'/!)-%!:.*(-H')6*4!^#48!O%\$%!\$,7(#\$(;!7.%8!3;!)-%!:.*(-H')6*4M.755'\$)*4,!#!/*48*4,!'/!0.7//&*%4)! '&&75#)*'4R9!=E&(7.*+);!'/!(#48!7.%!*4!)-*.!&#.%!O#.!5\$'+%4!3;!)-%!/#&!)#-#!"LL!;%#\$.!#,'!)-%!:.*(-H')6*4!\$%5%((%8!')-%\$.!/\$'1!)-%*\$!(#48!#48!8%1#48%8!5%\$1*..*4!/\$'1!'7).*8%\$.!O-'!O*.-%8!)'!5#..!' +%\$!*)9!F'4)*47*);!O#.!.%)#3(*.-%8!3;!5\$' '/!'/!)-%!/#&!)#-#!75!)'!M[[[!M]-%!(#48!O#.! '&&75*%8!3;!)-%!:.*(-H')6*49#!!

C4!)%\$1.'!'/!)-%!*\$, -.)-#)!/('O!/\$'1!#3'\$*,4#(!)*(%M

\$%/(%&).!#.'/'(('O.e!

: -%! *15(*&#)*'4.!'/!)-*.!U75\$%1%!F'7\$)!8%&.*'4!#\$%!5')%4)*#((;!%4'\$1'7.9!2.!F-*/!o7.)*&!>%+%;(!`&^#&-(*4!4')%8!*4!-%\$!\$7(*4,MQ)-*.!*!4')!1%\$%(!#!\$*, -)!'/!/*\$.)!\$%/7.#(!O*)-!\$.5%&!)')!F\$'O4!(#48!1#4#,%1%4)!\$!7.#,%!5(#4.!f!\$#)-%\$!)*.!#!\$*, -)!)'!5\$'#&)*+%;!7.%!#48!1#4#,%!)!-%!(#48R!>*(!c#((#,-%\$M#!/'\$1%\$!)\$%#);!\$*, -).!4%,')*#)'\$M4')%8!)-#!)-%!?'*\$.)!@#)*'4.!)-#!-#+%!4')!&%8%8!)-%*\$!)\$\$\$)*'\$;!Q-#+%!3%4!1#..*+%;!%15'O%\$%8!3;!)-*.!\$7(*4,!f!#48!)-%*\$!%E5%&)*#)'4.!-#+%!<7.)!*4&\$%#. %8!%E5'4%4)*#((;R#"!V%/7\$)-%\$!4')%.!)-#!17&-!'/!)-%!74%E5('*)%8!\$. '7\$&%.!(*%!*4!)-%!)\$#8)*'4#(!)\$\$\$)*'\$*%!.!'/!)-%!1'.)!8*.#8+#4)#,%8!&'1174*)%!.!*4!)-%!&'74)\$;9!!!

i 4%!.-'7(8!4')%M-'O%+%\$M!)-#!)-*.!\$7(*4,!#55(*%.'!4(;!)!'! e!

)-' .%!?'*\$.)!@#)*'4.!)-#!-#+%!)\$%#)*%!.!#\$%!4')!#//%&)%8!3;!)-*!.<78,1%4)!.*4&%!)-%!.%4&%!'/#!)\$%#);!O#.!)!&%8!&(#*1!)!#(!)\$%\$)*'\$;!%E&%5!)-#!Q\$.%\$+%8R!)!)-%19# \$!V%4&%!)-%/7((!15#&!O*((!3%/!%)!4!5\$'+*4&%.!(J!>*)*. -!F'(713*#!#48!q7%3%&!O-%\$%!)-%\$%!#\$%!/O!)\$%#)*%.9!:-*!.!*!.%5%&#((;!)-%!&#.%!.*4&%!)-%!\$%&%4)!.%\$*%!.!'/!&'7\$)!\$7(*4, .!1#J%.!)*!17&-!%#.*\$!/'\$!?'*\$.)!@#)*'4.!)'!&(#*1!&'4)\$'(!'+%\$!)-%*\$!)\$#8)*'4#(!#48.9!i4&%!#3'\$*,4#(!)*(%*!.%)#3(*.-%8M!)-%!,'+%\$41%4)!!'4(;!, '#,#,*4.)!#!?'*\$.)!@#)*'46.!O*.-%.!'!/*)!5\$'+%.!)-#!)*'!.<7.)/*%8!)'!8'!748%\$!)-%!F'4.)*7)*'49!!

! 2\$,7#3(;!)-%!1'.)!5\$'1*4%4)!'/!)-'.%!)#-#!+*%O!:.*(-H')*4!#.!7.-%\$*4,!*4!#!8\$#1#)*&!\$%'\$*%4)#)*'4!*4!23'\$*,4#(DF#4#8#!\$%(#)*'4.M%.5%&#((;!#.!)*!\$%(#)%!.)!\$%4%O#3(%!#48!4'4D\$%4%O#3(%!\$%. '7\$&!8%+%(51%4)!M#\$%!UO#*4!#48!>#*((%K"LMa0!#48!UO#*4!K"LM!09!c*+%4!)-#!#3'\$*,4#(!)*(%!4'O!/'O.!'/\$'1!7//&*%4)!M%E&(7.*+%!#48!

&' 4)*47' 7.! ' &&75#)*' 4! ' /! (#48! . *4&! 5\$%D&' 4)#&!) *1%A!)-%! F\$' O4! *.! (%/)! O*)-! #!
/*87&*#\$; !87); !#48!)-%!\$, -)!)' !%4&\$' #&-!' 4(; !*/!. ' 1%!3\$' #8%!573(*&!*4)%\$\$.)!<7.)*/%!.!
)9!: -%! -' (8%\$.!' /!23' \$, *4#(!*)(%! -#+%!')-%\$O*. %!/7(!8*. &\$%)*' 4!#3' 7!)-%!7.%!#48!
3%4%/*)!.!' /!)-* .!(#489!UO#*4!\$%//%\$.!)' !)-* .!#. !Q/%%!. *15(%!5(7.R!3%.%!*!)*. !4')!' 4(; !#!
&' ((%&)*+%!))(%!37)!#. !O%(!' 4%!) -#)!!3%! .7\$\$%48%\$%8!' 4(; !)' !)-%!F\$' O4!#48!)-#)!

::01<' 0=>!3#-*1!1\$' (' ?<.' **@!<0.\$%' =%!?/%!0- (A%\$!#B!C

. #**%. ?<E%!A' =<?!?/\$#-D/!\$%)\$%=%O?' ?<E%=#B!/?/%\$!. /#<. %!\$%=)%. ?<OD!' **!
?/%<\$!\$<D/?=#<O?%\$%=?!' O1!O%%1=!' =!CA#\$<D<O' *)%#) *%=9!

!

;O!)' '\$ D\$')/\!K!#B!<?=!1%. <=<#O!/?/%!R, , !O#?%=V!:W/%!B<\$=?!1%. *' '\$?<#O!=#- *1!999!A%!
D\$' O?%1!' =!\$%] -%=?%19!F#ON=?' ?-#!;O1<' O=! O1!HI?<=! '\$%!:;O1<' O=>!--O1%\$!=96547L8!
' O1!<?!<?!?/%!B%1%\$' *!D#E%\$O (%O?!?#!3/# (!?/%@!. ' O!?- \$O9>!W/%!R, , !\$%. #DO<^%=!/?/' ?!
?/<=!\$- *<OD!\$%1\$%==%=!/?/%!-O. %\$?' <O!)#=<?<#O!/?/' ?!/?/%!HI?<=! O1!O#ON=?' ?-#!;O1<' O=!
#B?%O!B#-O1!/?/% (=%*E%=9!"\$# (!)' '\$ D\$')/=!5Y!' O1!5L!#B!/?/%!1%. <=<#OV!!!!

!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!

G#?/!/?/%!B%1%\$' *!D#E%\$O (%O?!' O1!/?/%!)\$#E<O. <' *!D#E%\$O (%O?=/ ' E!
1%O<%1!/' E<OD!*%D<=*' ?<E%! - ?/#\$<?@!#E%\$!O#ON=?' ?-#!;O1<' O=! O1!HI?<=9!
C=!/?/%!?\$<' *!M- 1D%!B#-O1!#3/%O!HI?<=! O1!O#ON=?' ?-#!;O1<' O=!/' E!
' =P%1!/?/01111 (@!1. 90501625. 488-564Tm/TT481T24000. 405. 24060E) -O-1#!-O. 1 ((#)O.

Y9!!C. . %)?' O. %!A@!/?/%! (#1%\$O!HI ?<=!. # ((-O<?@9!

?#!?/%!F' ?<#O' *!dO%\$D@!G#' \$19! " #!\$/%!'))\$#)\$<' ?%O%==! #B!?/<=!1%*%D' ?<#O!?/%!!!!R, , !
\$%B*%. ?%1!' =!B#**#3=V#>!

W/%!, \$#30!(' @!<O1%%1!\$%*#!#O!=?%)=!' P%O!A@!' O!' 1 (<O<=?\$' ?<E%!A#1@!

S /< *% ! ? / % ! , \$ # 3 0 ! (' @ ! \$ % * @ ! # 0 ! ? / % ! F d G j = !) \$ # . % = ! ? # ! B - * B < * ! < ? = ! 1 - ? @ ! ? # !
. # 0 = - * ? # ! ? / % ! . # 0 = - * ? ' ? < # 0 ! ' 0 1 ! ' . . # ((# 1 ' ? < # 0 ! % B B # \$? = ! < 0 ! ? / < = ! . ' = % ! 3 % \$ % !
< 0 ' 1 %] - ' ? % ! ' 0 1 ! B % * * ! = / # \$? ! < 0 ! = % E % \$ ' * ! \$ % =) % . ? = 0 ! " < \$ = ? # ! ? / % ! < 0] - \$ @ ! 3 ' = !
(< = 1 < \$ % . ? % 1 0 ! W / % ! . # 0 = - * ? ' ? < E % ! < 0] - \$ @ ! < = ! 0 # ? !) \$ #) % \$ * @ ! < 0 ? # !
% 0 E < \$ # 0 (% 0 ? ' * ! % B B % . ? = !

. ' =% =9!W / < = ! < = ! ? / % ! R , , ! = ? ' ? % (% O ? ! ' ? !) ' \$ ' D \$ ') / ! L 5 ! # B ! ? / % ! , / <)) % 3 ' = ! . ' = % ! O ' (% * @ ! ? / ' ? !

: W / % ! 1 - ? @ ! ? # ! . # O = - * ? ! < = ! O # ? ! ? \$ < D D % \$ % 1 ! A @ ! / < = ? # \$ < . ' * ! < () ' . ? = 9 ! ; ? ! < = ! O # ? ! ? / % ! E % / < . * % !

? # ! ' 1 1 \$ % = ! / < = ? # \$ < . ' * ! D \$ < % E ' O . % = > 9 !

; ? ! < = ! O # ? ! . * % ' \$! ? # ! (% ! M - = ? ! 3 / ' ? ! (< D / ? ! A % ! ' ? ! = ? ' P % ! / % \$ % 9 ! H < D / ? ! < ? ! (% ' O ! ? / ' ? ! ? / % ! . * ' < (! # B !

' ! * ' . P ! # B ! : B \$ % % !) \$ < # \$! ' O 1 ! < O B # \$ (% 1 ! . ! M - A

;O!?\$ (=!#B!/?/%)#?%O?<' *!. #O=%] -%O.%=!#B!/?/!R, , !1%. <=<#O=#/?/!B#. -=!/%\$%!
3<**!A%!<(<?%1!/?#!/?/!/?3#!. '=%=!/?/' ?! \$%!\$%B%\$\$\$1!/?#!' A#E%! ' =!:'D' (%!. /' OD%\$=>!i!
O' (%*@!/?/!W=<*/]#?J<O!' O1!a' O<%*=!1%. <=<#O=9!W-\$O<OD!B<\$=?!/?#!/?/!/*' ??%\$+!/?/!
O- (%\$<.' *!<()<.' ?<#O=! ' \$%!.*% '\$*@!1\$' (' ?<.' !' O1!/?/!<O=?<?-?<#O' *!<()<.' ?<#O=! ' \$%+!' ?!
?/%!E%\$@!*' =?+<P%*@!/?#!A%!1%<.' ?%+!%E%O!1<=\$-)?<E%9!;O!?\$ (=!#B!/?/!B#\$ (%\$+B\$# (!
.#* - (O!Y!#B!W' A*%!5!#B!. /')?%\$!7!#B! (@!B#\$?/. # (<OD!A##P!4
8!/?/!=?' ?-;!;O1<' O!)#) -*' ?<#O!#O!' O1!#BB!/?/!\$%=%\$E%=-!<O!
7K5Y!3' =!656+cL\+!3/<^%!/?/' ?!#B!O#ON=?' ?-;!;O1<' O=!3' =!75Y+6KK!' O1!/?/' ?!#B!/?/!
HI?<=!3' =!L5e+eYK!B#\$!' O!#E%\$' **!/?#?' *!#B!5+\7+K7\!;O1<D%O#-;!.<?<^%O=9!;O!?- \$O+!/?/!
=/%%\$!O- (A%\$=!-DD%=?!/?/' ?!/?/!\$#*%! O1!=?' ?-\$!#B!;2C, !4<9%9!/?/!;O1<D%O#-;!)

?\$' 1<?<#O' *!%\$<?#\$@!' O1!#?/%\$%B#\$%+A%!' A*%!#?!%&%\$?! (#\$\$!<OB* -%O. %!#E%\$!\$%=# -\$. %!
 1%. <=<#O=!<O. * -1<OD!#/?=#!\$%*' ?<OD!#?!\$%E%O-%!' **#. ' ?<#O+!<O. * -1<OD!\$#@' *?<%=9!

G%#@#O1!#/?%!\$%E%O-%!<==-%!#/?%\$%!=%% (=!#A%! (-. /!. #O. %\$O!#/?' ?!W=<*/]#?}<O!
 (#1%*!3<**!=*#3!1#3O! (' M#\$!\$%=# -\$. %!) \$#M%. ?=9!W/<=!<=! ' !#/? (%!<O!#/?!) ') %\$!A@!

BIBLIOGRAPHY!

, /\$<=?<%!F#\$1#O!47KK\8!:, /' **%OD%=!?!_!\$A' O!CA#\$<D<O' *!F#E%\$O' O. %>!<O!H<. /' %*!
H-\$)/@!4%1+8! !4m<OD=?#O!;O=?<?-?!#B!

;O?%\$D#E%\$O(%O?' *!U%*' ?<#O=8!6LN55\9!!

!F#1*%3=P' +!, /\$<=?<O' !' O1!T%\$\$ (@!S%AA%\$!47KKc8!;W/%!, ' *1%\$!a%. <=<#O!CA#\$<D<O' *!
W?%*!W\$%' ?<%=+' O1!/?/%!F<=D' J' >+<O!O' (' \$!' #=?%\$!O%' ?/%\$!U' E%O! ' O1!T%\$\$ (@!
S%AA%\$!4%1=98!

4n' O. #-E%\$V!_G, !2\$%==8!5NYh9!

f\$' ((#O1!RIA' =?<%O!47K5Y8!*Terms of Coexistence: Indigenous Peoples and
Canadian Law* (Toronto: Carswell).!